

# DRAFT

## Adjourned Meeting Of the Northeast Presbytery, A.R.P.C. *Bonclarken, Flat Rock, North Carolina* *3:00 P.M., June 11, 2008*

- 080601 An adjourned meeting of Northeast Presbytery, ARP, was held on June 11, 2008 in Room 3 of the Hotel at the Bonclarken ARP Conference Center, Flat Rock, N.C.
- 080602 TE David Johnston, Moderator, called the meeting to order and opened the meeting with prayer.
- 080603 The Moderator explained the absence of the Principal Clerk, TE G. J. Gerard, and recommended that TE Fred Carr, Principal Clerk-elect, be chosen to serve as Principal Clerk for this meeting of Presbytery. The motion carried.
- 080604 TE Carr invited members of the court to sign the enrollment sheets but indicated that a quorum was not present. Presbytery agreed to proceed with the meeting with the understanding that the actions would be endorsed by a future meeting of Presbytery. The following ministers were present:
- |                  |                  |                     |
|------------------|------------------|---------------------|
| Avera, Alan      | Matthews, Paul   | Sutherland, William |
| Carr, Fredrick   | Moon, Suk Ho     | Van Dyk, Jack       |
| Chung, Young Hwa | Moorlach, Kent   | Whittet, Robert J.  |
| Galletta, David  | Pang, Ji Kag     | Wittke, James F.    |
| Johnston, David  | Pritts, Ronald   | Yim, Sung Sub       |
| Kim, Hong Suk    | Reed, Clyde      | Young, Curt         |
| Lim, Jae H.      | Roberts, Charles |                     |
- The following Ruling Elder delegates were present:  
Weston Robinson, Church of the Atonement  
Wayne Elban Kirkridge A.R.P.  
Lou Schillinger Alternate Kirkridge A.R.P.  
Steve Manning, New Windsor A.R.P.
- The following Students of Theology were present:  
Anderson, Rick                      Meberg, Erik
- 080605 TE Carr presented a Program/Docket which was approved as amended.
- 080606 The Moderator appointed TE David Galletta to serve as Reading Clerk for this meeting of Presbytery.
- 080607 The following guests were recognized: Rev. Young Chung Kim, Rev. Craig Combs, Mrs. Tammy Anderson, Mrs. Connie Johnston, Mrs. Anne Reed, and Mrs. Joan Pritts.
- Report of the Principal Clerk**
- 080608 TE Carr presented a report as Principal Clerk.

## DRAFT

- 080609 Note was made that the Annual Statistical Report has not been received from the following NEP congregations: Calvary Reformed Church, Christian Center Ministries, Fairmount ARP Church, Global Vision ARP Church, Hyo Shin Bible Presbyterian Church, Iranian Christian Church of Washington, D.C., Philadelphia Korean Presbyterian Church, Soonshin Bible Presbyterian Church, The Joyful Church of New York, the Kwang Myung ARP Church of NY, and the Yae Dam Presbyterian Church.
- 080610 A request for information from the Session of the Kirkridge Church regarding the need to seek the approval of Presbytery before refinancing its mortgage loan, was answered as follows: Presbytery understands that this request is made in accord with FOG XII, B., 2., g. and grants permission to the Kirkridge Church to refinance its mortgage with the following stipulation, that the approval of the Presbytery in this matter does not obligate the Presbytery to accept responsibility for the mortgage in the event of default by the congregation.
- 080611 A report from Michael Ritchie, Trustee and Member of the Kingsborough ARP Church Ecclesiastical Commission was read. (See Annex A) (Note was made that this has the effect of being a report from the Trustees.) The Presbytery voted that the commission be dissolved after the final review of all property liquidation documentation. Note was made of the exceptional and timely leadership of Mr. Ritchie and Presbytery agreed to convey its thanks to him when the Presbytery meets in the Fall.
- 080612 Presbytery voted to table until the Fall Stated Meeting, the reading and approval of the Minutes of the Spring Stated Meeting. Note was made that at that time the Annual Report of the Presbytery would be presented along with an updated Directory of Presbytery's leaders.
- 080613 Note was made that the MOP requires that requests for items to be included in the Presbytery's 2009 Budget, be received by the Stewardship Committee, not later than September 1, 2008.
- 080614 TE Carr presented the following as having requested excused absence from this meeting of Presbytery: TE's G.J. Gerard, Tony Cowley, Ben Willford and Candidate Nathan Carlson. Note was made that the Principal Clerk may have received other requests which were not forwarded to TE Carr. Presbytery voted to grant the requested excused absences.

### **Ministry Teams**

#### **Outreach North America**

- 080615 TE Jim Wittke reported on behalf of the Outreach Northeast Ministry Team, (Annex B). A summary of the report of TE Johnston, regarding the May 1, 2008 NAPARC gathering was presented (See the full report at Annex C). The following recommendations were approved:
- 080616 That TE Johnston's report be received and, based upon the counsel given in the report, that NEP officially sanction the Christ Church as a Mission Work for the Presbytery.

## DRAFT

- 080617 That the Provisional Session of the Christ Mission Grove City be constituted as follows: TE David Johnston, TE Ron Pritts, RE Wayne Greenwood, and RE Lucas Azang-Njaah.
- 080618 That the call to TE Iain Duguid as Mission Developer commencing July 1, 2008, be approved (See Annex D) and that it be placed in his hands. Note was made that the terms of the call should be considered separately from the funding package.
- 080619 That the NEP pray for the Grove City work as well as the other mission works of the Presbytery. Presbytery paused for prayer.
- 080620 That NEP authorize Rick Anderson to continue his exploratory church planting work in the New Cumberland, WV area under the mentoring of TE David Johnston and the Lifeline Session and that Presbytery formally request Intern funding from ONA.
- 080621 That in regard to the practice of Pacific Presbytery of establishing Korean-language congregations within the geographical boundaries of NEP, a committee of Presbytery composed of TE's Curt Young, Fred Carr, Ron Pritts, and Suk Ho Moon be directed to prepare a correspondence to the Executive Committee of Synod (which is considering the issues involved in this practice as well as other practices) expressing the Presbytery's concern. Note was made that NEP's work in California was begun only after the Synod had given permission to do so. (See Minutes of 2005 Synod, p. 137 which reads, "A motion carried that Northeast presbytery be permitted to develop a mission congregation in Orange County CA.")
- 080622 That the report of ONE as a whole be received.
- 080623 Presbytery voted to express its gratitude to TE Wittke for his exceptional work in leading the ONE Team.

### **Pastoral Support And Development Team**

- 080624 TE Carr reported on behalf of the Pastoral Support and Development Team that Rick Anderson, Student of Theology, graduated from Reformed Presbyterian Theological Seminary in May. He noted that in accord with MOP Appendix C., Annex 1, "How to Receive and Care for Candidates for the Ministry", Mr. Anderson has declined to seek licensure and instead is seeking ordination (#24). The Team concurs with the request of Mr. Anderson, believing his trial for ministry has been made (#25) not requiring a further probation period and recommends that Presbytery accept his request and refer him to the Credentials Team for ordination examination. Mr. Anderson was asked to describe his practical experience in ministry, and he did so. The motion passed.
- 080625 TE Carr reported that Nathan Carlson, Student of Theology graduated from Biblical Theological Seminary. He describing Mr. Carlson's current situation and thoughts about the future. Note was made that he anticipates being examined for licensure at the Fall Stated Meeting.

# DRAFT

## **Credentials Team**

- 080626 TE Bill Sutherland reported on behalf of the Credentials Team that the Team already met with Mr. Anderson and examined him in accord with the FOG and the MOP and is prepared to recommend him to Presbytery. Presbytery voted to proceed with Mr. Anderson's examination on the floor of Presbytery.
- 080627 The Team presented a review of the process they used in examining Mr. Anderson, noting that the Team reviewed Mr. Anderson's academic preparation and credentials and had conducted an examination of his personal Christian religious experience, his knowledge of English Bible; of the history and government, discipline and worship of the ARP; and of his knowledge and views in theology. Mr. Anderson indicated no exception to any part of the Westminster Standards and subscribes to them fully.
- 080628 Report was made of a review of Mr. Anderson's sermon previously preached to Presbytery.
- 080629 Presbytery voted to sustain his examination.
- 080630 The Team presented to Presbytery a Call from the Lifeline Community Church to Mr. Anderson, to serve as Associate-Pastor (See Annex E). Presbytery voted to approve the Call and present it to Mr. Anderson.
- 080631 Presbytery agreed to direct the Moderator to appoint a Commission to ordain Mr. Anderson on Sunday, June 29, 2008 at the Lifeline Congregation.

## **Administrative Committees**

- 080632 Several announcements were made by various committees.
- 080633 The Presbytery paused for a season of prayer for TE Gerard and his family.
- 080634 TE Carr noted that future meetings of Presbytery will beheld as follows:  
Fall Stated Meeting, Oct. 9-10, 2008 in Ballston Center ARP Church  
Spring Stated Meeting, March 5-6, 2009 in Hyo Shin Church, Flushing, NY  
Adjourned Meeting, June 10, 2009 Bonclarken, Flat Rock, NC  
Fall Stated Meeting, Oct. 8-9, 2009 Piney Creek Church, Taneytown, MD
- 080635 Their being no further business, declared the Presbytery adjourned by common consent and presbyters shared in a time of prayer.

Annex A

Northeast Presbytery, ARPC  
Ecclesiastical Commission-Property Oversight of the Kingsborough Associate  
Reformed Presbyterian Church  
June 6, 2008

Status of Kingsborough Property Sale-

## DRAFT

On June 3, 2008 the property was transferred to a new owner. The Closing Statement and other Court communications are attached. The current assets and liabilities transmitted to the Northeast Presbytery are summarized below:

• Property Sale	\$34,140.09
• Checking/Saving Account	\$393.47
• Check to the Living Hope Church	<u>(\$4,000.00)</u>
• Total Assets designated to Northeast Presbytery ONE	\$30,533.56

The only known outstanding issues are:

- The National Grid, electric and gas utilities have been requested to be turned off. The final bill/credit will be forwarded.
- The Insurance has been canceled and any credit will be forwarded.
- A Check for 10% of the gross sales price (\$4,000) should be sent to:  
Living Hope Church  
PO Box 1252  
Gloversville, NY 12078

All other known issues have been resolved in an orderly fashion and it is recommended that after a review of all property liquidation documentation that the commission be dissolved.

Submitted By:

/s/ Michael H. Ritchie

Michael H. Ritchie, Trustee, Northeast Presbytery  
Kingsborough ARP Church/ Ecclesiastical Commission

Annex B

### OUTREACH NORTHEAST REPORT June 2008 Synod Meeting

Your committee continues to be extremely active as we balance the extension of the presbytery within the Maryland, Pennsylvania, and West Virginia area while responding to requests that come from the outlying areas of our geographical bounds.

#### **KOREAN CHURCES**

The ONA Team wants to emphasize its continuing commitment to our Korean brothers and to let them know that they are very welcome in the presbytery. In light of our limited resources, limited time and limited knowledge of the needs of First and Second Generation Korean churches, it remains our policy to rely upon the advice of the Korean Fellowship Churches for direction about admission to the presbytery of both particular congregations and mission works

The committee, working through G J Gerard is ready to report on several new Korean churches. The "See Him" church under the direction of Mr. J. B. Oh has applied for

## DRAFT

membership. TE Ron Pritts was asked to meet with this group and the committee awaits the result of his report. The “Living Stone Church” of Cincinnati, Ohio, under the direction of TE Paul Kim has forwarded to Rev Gerard the application papers for this congregation. Rev Gerard has reported that they are in order, so we will be recommending that this congregation be “taken under care,” of the presbytery. (This is following the two step process that we used with the “Philadelphia Church.”)

### **CHRIST MISSION (GROVE CITY)**

TE David Johnston and your chairman have visited Grove City multiple times to meet with TE Iain Duguid and to survey the area surrounding. TE and Mrs. Johnston fellowshipped with the worshipping community that is assembling in Grove City. The ONE team is satisfied that there is room for another “reformed” work in the area. TE Johnston has a separate written report about the findings of the ONE team and we are recommending that the presbytery go ahead with the work. Synod has money allocated to support this work along with the money that we authorized at the Spring meeting. We are recommending a Call be issued to TE Duguid to commence this work in earnest.

### **COVENANT MISSION (New Cumberland, West Virginia)**

Rick Anderson has completed his seminary training and is sensing a call to plant a church

In his home town area of New Cumberland, West Virginia. In consultation with the ONA Board, the ONE Team is in agreement that Rick labor part-time in developing the New Cumberland work. A Call to Rick Anderson should be forthcoming from the Lifeline Church. The plan is for Rick to be funded through the ONA Internship program while he attends Church Planting Classes and the Assessment Center. With the conformation and leading of the Holy Spirit on this work it would be our intention to solicit a funding package from Synod at the November meeting of the ONA board and then to issue a Call to Rick Anderson as a Mission Developer commencing January 2009.

### **FINANANCING THE KINGDOM:**

The presbytery is to be reminded that we have committed resources to the work in Grove City under the direction of Iain Duguid. We have also made commitments to Rick Anderson for the New Cumberland, West Virginia work. These two commitments will exhaust the balance of our \$80,000+ fund. We are willing to entertain requests for funding new works, but you need to be aware that ALL our funds are committed.

The ONE team desires to be proactive in beginning new works and so we commend the need for funds to each church and ask that presbytery giving be made a priority item for your 2009 stewardship planning.

**RECOMMENDATIONS:** (Approved recommendations included at par. 080616-080621.)

# DRAFT

May 1, 2008, Grove City NAPARC Gathering

The meeting was a response to the call of Presbytery of the Ohio, Orthodox Presbyterian Church. The impetus for their call was the proposal of Northeast Presbytery to plant a church in Grove City, PA, with TE Iain Duguid as Mission Developer. Representatives came from the OPC, PCA, RPCNA and RCUS. Northeast Presbytery was represented by Moderator Johnston, TE Jim Wittke and TE Iain Duguid.

Rev. Dan Knox, of Ohio Presbytery, moderated the meeting and summarized events that led to the call for the meeting. His summary included our Presbytery's receiving Iain Duguid and subsequently acting to move ahead with a church plant that had earlier been rejected by the Ascension Presbytery of the PCA.

## **Northeast Presbytery presentation**

Northeast Presbytery presented the case for why we consider it appropriate to proceed with a proposal that was rejected by a sister presbytery and is opposed by the Reformed pastors in the local area. (Our presentation is available separately. There was neither comment nor discussion of our presentation.)

The meeting then moved to presentations of opposition and accusation.

## **Opposition Presentations**

It became clear early in the meeting that Iain Duguid's proposal to plant a church got entwined with unwise things that were said, and misunderstandings that multiplied. An almost impenetrable web of misunderstanding and distrust quickly spread within Ascension Presbytery, and to outside pastors.

**Accusation:** TE Duguid has said, "Other Reformed churches in Grove City don't preach the Gospel."

The most volatile accusation raised against TE Duguid is that "He said that the Reformed churches in the Grove City area don't preach the gospel." When it was asked in the meeting who was the source of such claims, no one seemed to know. One person said, "We keep hearing it from students." Another acknowledged that it came from second, third and fourth-hand reports.

The argument seemed to be that "It must be so because it keeps being reported." In a court of law, this kind of report would be quickly disallowed as hearsay, and therefore not acceptable as evidence. In this meeting the accusation was repeated and seemed to be accepted as valid, despite the presence of TE Duguid, who said, "This is not what I think and it is not what I have said."

A pastor from the RPCNA challenged everyone present that in the face of Mr. Duguid's clear and unequivocal denial in our presence, we all have a responsibility to oppose such a claim, ask who was the source, tell the bearer of the report that we know what they are saying is wrong, and tell the reporter that they must go back and tell their informant that it is wrong. There was silence in the room.

**Accusation:** Refusal to submit to authority and "presbytery shopping"

Another accusation is that Iain Duguid refused to submit to the authority of Ascension Presbytery when they rejected his church-plant proposal, and went "presbytery shopping." When we examined TE Duguid for admission to Northeast Presbytery, we talked with him about why he sought membership in our Presbytery. This is a matter about which we have concern because of our NAPARC relationships.

We have learned from difficult experience in our own Presbytery that it's important

## DRAFT

that a presbytery and minister are a proper fit for each other. Within the past few years, Northeast Presbytery received a minister who had been a member of another ARP presbytery. Although we received him gladly and did not find any defect in either him or his theology, within a short time it became clear that he did not “fit” in the presbytery. He became a focus and cause of controversy. He was not chargeable with any deficiency, error, or misconduct. Nevertheless, it seemed clear that he needed to be in a different presbytery—perhaps even a different denomination—where he would fit better. That is what finally happened, to the great benefit of the man, his congregation, our presbytery and his new presbytery.

Northeast Presbytery's discussion with Iain Duguid caused us to think that a similar situation may have occurred in his relationship with Ascension Presbytery. This is neither an accusation nor a claim of fault against Ascension Presbytery. It is merely an observation that such things occur, as they did with us, and that the best remedy often is a change of presbytery. We viewed this as seeking peace in the Lord's house.

### **Accusation:** Harm to existing congregations

Presentations in the meeting claimed that harm has already been done to the existing congregations in and around Grove City. When a person present in the meeting asked for specifics, no supporting evidence was presented for any actual harm. In fact, the existing Reformed congregations are all thriving and have very little space for absorbing more people.

### **Accusation:** Harm to Reformed unity in the community

There were also claims that emotions have been inflamed within the Reformed community of Grove City. The people we talked with outside the meeting are themselves very involved in this “Reformed community” and did not see this as a significant issue. It seemed clear to us that the accusers clamoring against TE Duguid share in responsibility if there is any such harm.

### **Obvious message:** Personal animosity toward TE Duguid

The most obvious message communicated to us in the NAPARC gathering in Grove City was not in the carefully-crafted words that were spoken. The most obvious message to us was the intensity of personal animosity toward Iain Duguid. This was a very disappointing—even depressing—aspect of the meeting. We were grieved by the continuing thread of personal animosity in more than one presentation.

At one point the antagonism descended to the level of a person's making accusations of doctrinal error against Mr. Duguid. The accuser has, in both written and oral communication, demonstrated a high level of personal antagonism toward TE Duguid. This antagonism had the effect of devaluing what he presented in the meeting.

### **Considerations toward a wise decision**

It seemed to us that in order for Northeast Presbytery to make a godly, wise and well-informed decision about the matters presented in Grove City, we needed more information and a broader perspective than was presented in the meeting. Therefore, we continued gathering information, seeking understanding, and talking with people in the area. The perspective we have gained has considerable discontinuity with the monolithic presentation given in the meeting.

The opposition in and around Grove City seems to be driven by three pastors, all of whom are defensive and emotional in what they say. They are all orthodox men who have sterling reputations as pastors. They are respected in their presbyteries. We value

## DRAFT

that respect and their reputations. Nevertheless, for the following reasons, we find ourselves inclined to disallow the case that they presented.

First is the emotion and animosity that were evident, as mentioned above. They devalue the arguments presented and disgrace those who have been lured into the trap and attacked a fellow Christian.

Second is the need for an additional Reformed work in Grove City. Resistance to starting an additional Reformed work in Grove City has already added considerable impetus for two new Reformed works in the nearby town of Slippery Rock. Those works are attracting students and faculty from Grove City College. One Grove City person we talked with encouraged us “not to miss the opportunity to bless our community with a church plant in Grove City.” This person is a leader in a Reformed church. Another person said, “I am a member of one of the opposing churches. I think that another Reformed church is needed, and the church plant should go forward.” These voices were not heard in the NAPARC meeting. Both people spoke their thoughts to us without our soliciting either person's viewpoint.

Third, there is evidence that this mission is already meeting needs that the existing churches do not have the capacity to meet. There are more community residents and students attending the Bible studies than could be absorbed into those churches, and TE Duguid is already taking on pastoral ministry and evangelistic outreach that adds to that which is being done at present.

While we wish to avoid any action that would be offensive to our NAPARC brothers, we have a greater concern for strengthening and extending the Kingdom of the Lord Jesus Christ. We believe that this work is needed for even more reasons than are mentioned here. Turning back at this point could actually be burdensome to the existing churches, although they do not see that possibility at this time.

### **Recommendation:**

Our recommendation is that the work proceed according to plan, and that we communicate our decision to the Ascension Presbytery of the PCA, the Presbytery of the Ohio of the OPC, Presbytery of the Alleghenies of the RPCNA and the Covenant East Classis of the RCUS.

Annex D

Call for a Mission Developer  
From  
Northeast Presbytery of the  
Associate Reformed Presbyterian Church

We the officers and members of Northeast Presbytery being well satisfied with your ministerial qualifications, and confident that we have been led to you by the Holy Spirit as one whose ministry will be profitable for the advancement of the Kingdom of Christ, do earnestly call you, Reverend Doctor Iain Duguid, to undertake the call of Mission Developer for Christ Mission of Grove City, Pennsylvania, effective July 1, 2008.

On acceptance of this our call we promise you in the discharge of your duty, the following support and encouragement in the Lord.

That you may devote yourself to the Ministry of the Word, we promise and obligate

## DRAFT

ourselves to:

- a. Pay you an annual salary of \$12,000 in at least monthly installments.
- b. Housing: Provide you with a housing allowance of \$12,000, in at least monthly payments.
- c. Pay zero toward your moving expenses.
- d. Grant you a travel allowance of zero.
- e. Pay into the Associate Reformed Presbyterian Retirement Plan Fund as prescribed by Synod. (calculated at \$2,400 per year)
- f. Pay zero for Group Insurance.  
(They have Group Insurance through Grove City College)
- g. Review annually with you the adequacy of this compensation.
- h. Grant you an annual vacation of four weeks.

We desire to express our commitment to you and to your family for events that should occur in the providence of God. Every effort will be made to assist and lovingly sustain and uphold you and/or your family should such an event occur.

- a. To continue the provisions of this call for a period not to exceed three months from the onset of total disability.

In testimony whereof we have respectively subscribed our names this 12<sup>th</sup> day of June 2008 A. D.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Rev. David Johnston  
Moderator  
Northeast

\_\_\_\_\_  
Rev. Fred Carr  
Acting Principal Clerk

\_\_\_\_\_  
Rev. James Wittke  
Chairman Outreach

Annex E

Call to Mr. Anderson

### CALL FOR AN ASSOCIATE PASTOR

We the officers and members of the Lifeline Community Church, ARP, of Northeast Presbytery, being well satisfied with your ministerial qualifications, and confident that we have been led to you by the Holy Spirit as one whose ministry will be profitable to our spiritual interest, do earnestly call you, Rick Anderson, to undertake the call as Associate Pastor for Church Planting Outreach, effective July 1, 2008.

On the acceptance of this our call we promise you in the discharge of your duty all proper support, encouragement, and obedience in the Lord.

That you may devote yourself wholly to the Ministry of the Word and the work of outreach, we promise and obligate ourselves to:

Pay you an annual salary of \$ 15,000, in at least monthly payments.

Housing: No housing provision.

Pay no moving expenses, since no move is necessary.

## DRAFT

No travel allowance.

Pay into the Associate Reformed Presbyterian Retirement Plan Fund as prescribed by the General Synod. (Since this is a part-time position, this will not apply.)

Group Insurance

We anticipate that you will be covered through Mrs. Anderson's employer.

Review with you annually the adequacy of this compensation.

Grant you an annual vacation of two weeks.

We desire also to express our commitment to you and to your family for events which could occur in the providence of God. Every effort will be made to assist and lovingly sustain and uphold you and/or your family should such an event occur.

a. In the event of total disability, as defined in the Synod's insurance program, we promise: To continue the provisions of this call for a period not to exceed three months from the onset of total disability.

b. In the event you should die during the terms of this call, we promise: To continue the provisions of this call dealing with annual salary for a period of three months.

In testimony whereof we have respectively subscribed our names this first day of June, 2008.